# Inference in Belief Networks 

CMPUT 261: Introduction to Artificial Intelligence
P\&M §8.4

## Lecture Outline

1. Recap
2. Factors
3. Variable Elimination
4. Further Optimizations

After this lecture, you should be able to:

- encode a factoring of a joint distribution as a collection of factor objects for variable elimination
- define the factor operations used in variable elimination
- describe the high-level steps of variable elimination
- compare efficiency of different variable orderings for variable elimination
- trace an execution of variable elimination


## Recap: Belief Networks

## Definition:

A belief network (or Bayesian network) consists of:

1. A directed acyclic graph, with each node labelled by a random variable
2. A domain for each random variable
3. A conditional probability table for each variable given its parents

- The graph represents a specific factorization of the full joint distribution
- Semantics:

Every node is independent of its non-descendants, conditional on its parents

## Recap: Queries

- The most common task for a belief network is to query posterior probabilities given some observations
- Easy cases:
- Posteriors of a single variable conditional only on parents
- Joint distributions of variables early in a compatible variable ordering
- Typically, the observations have no straightforward relationship to the target
- This lecture: mechanical procedure for computing arbitrary queries



## A (Simplistic) Algorithm for Queries

```
P(F,T,A,L,S,R)=P(F)P(T)P(A|T,F)P(L|A)P(S|F)P(R|L)
```

Query: $P(F \mid S=1, R=1)$

1. Condition: $P(F, T, A, L, S=1, R=1)=P(F) P(T) P(A \mid T, F) P(S=1 \mid F) P(L \mid A) P(R=1 \mid L)$
2. Normalize: $P(F, T, A, L \mid S=1, R=1)=\frac{P(F, T, A, L, S=1, R=1)}{\sum_{\substack{f \in \operatorname{dom}(F), t \in \operatorname{dom}(T), a \in \operatorname{dom}(A), l \in \operatorname{dom}(L)}} P(F=f, T=t, A=a, L=l, S=1, R=1)}$
3. Marginalize: $P(F \mid S=1, R=1)=\sum_{\substack{t \in \operatorname{dom}(T), a \in \operatorname{dom}(A), l \in \operatorname{dom}(L)}} P(F, T=t, A=a, L=l \mid S=1, R=1)$

## Factors

- The Variable Elimination algorithm exploits the factorization of a joint probability distribution encoded by a belief network in order to answer queries
- A factor is a function $f\left(X_{1}, \ldots, X_{k}\right)$ from random variables to a real number
- Input: factors representing the conditional probability tables from the belief network
$P($ Leaving $\mid$ Alarm $) P($ Smoke $\mid$ Fire $) P($ Alarm $\mid$ Tampering, Fire $) P($ Tampering $) P($ Fire $)$
becomes
$f_{1}($ Leaving, Alarm $) f_{2}($ Smoke, Fire $) f_{3}($ Alarm, Tampering, Fire $) f_{4}$ (Tampering) $f_{5}($ Fire $)$
- Output: A new factor encoding the target posterior distribution
E.g., $f_{12}$ (Tampering).


## Conditional Probabilities as Factors

- A conditional probability $P\left(Y \mid X_{1}, \ldots, X_{n}\right)$ is a factor $f\left(Y, X_{1}, \ldots, X_{n}\right)$ that obeys the constraint:
$\forall v_{1} \in \operatorname{dom}\left(X_{1}\right), v_{2} \in \operatorname{dom}\left(X_{2}\right), \ldots, v_{n} \in \operatorname{dom}\left(X_{n}\right):\left[\sum_{y \in \operatorname{dom}(Y)} f\left(y, v_{1}, \ldots, v_{n}\right)\right]=1$.
- Answer to a query is a factor constructed by applying operations to the input factors
- Operations on factors are not guaranteed to maintain this constraint!
- Solution: Don't sweat it!
- Operate on unnormalized probabilities during the computation
- Normalize at the end of the algorithm to re-impose the constraint


## Conditioning

Conditioning is an operation on a single factor

- Constructs a new factor that returns the values of the original factor with some of its inputs fixed


## Definition:

For a factor $f_{1}\left(X_{1}, \ldots, X_{k}\right)$, conditioning on $X_{i}=v_{i}$ yields a new factor

$$
f_{2}\left(X_{1}, \ldots X_{i-1}, X_{i+1}, \ldots, X_{k}\right)=\left(f_{1}\right)_{X_{i}=v_{i}}
$$

such that for all values $v_{1}, \ldots, v_{i-1}, v_{i+1}, \ldots, v_{k}$ in the domain of $X_{1}, \ldots X_{i-1}, X_{i+1}, \ldots, X_{k}$

$$
f_{2}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{i-1}, v_{i+1}, \ldots, v_{k}\right)=f_{1}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{i-1}, \mathbf{v}_{\mathbf{i}}, v_{i+1}, \ldots, v_{k}\right) .
$$

## Conditioning Example

$$
f_{2}(A, B)=f_{1}(A, B, C)_{C=t r u e}
$$

| A | B | C | value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| F | F | F | 0.1 |
| F | F | T | 0.88 |
| F | T | F | 0.12 |
| F | T | T | 0.45 |
| T | F | F | 0.7 |
| T | F | T | 0.66 |
| T | T | F | 0.1 |
| T | T | T | 0.25 |


| A | B | value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| F | F | 0.88 |
| F | T | 0.45 |
| T | F | 0.66 |
| T | T | 0.25 |

## Multiplication

Multiplication is an operation on two factors

- Constructs a new factor that returns the product of the rows selected from each factor by its arguments


## Definition:

For two factors $f_{1}\left(X_{1}, \ldots, X_{j}, Y_{1}, \ldots, Y_{k}\right)$ and $f_{2}\left(Y_{1}, \ldots, Y_{k}, Z_{1}, \ldots, Z_{\ell}\right)$, multiplication of $f_{1}$ and $f_{2}$ yields a new factor

$$
\left(f_{1} \times f_{2}\right)=f_{3}\left(X_{1}, \ldots, X_{j}, Y_{1}, \ldots, Y_{k}, Z_{1}, \ldots, Z_{\ell}\right)
$$

such that for all values $x_{1}, \ldots, x_{j}, y_{1}, \ldots, y_{k}, z_{1}, \ldots, z_{\ell}$,

$$
f_{3}\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{j}, y_{1}, \ldots, y_{k}, z_{1}, \ldots, z_{\ell}\right)=f_{1}\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{j}, y_{1}, \ldots, y_{k}\right) f 2\left(y_{1}, \ldots, y_{k}, z_{1}, \ldots, z_{\ell}\right)
$$

## Multiplication Example

$$
f_{3}(A, B, C)=f_{1}(A, B) \times f_{2}(B, C)
$$



| A | B | C | value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| F | F | F | 0.1 |
| F | F | T | 0 |
| F | T | F | 0.1 |
| F | T | T | 0.05 |
| T | F | F | 0.3 |
| T | F | T | 0 |
| T | T | F | 0.2 |
| T | T | T | 0.1 |

## Summing Out

Summing out is an operation on a single factor

- Constructs a new factor that returns the sum over all values of a random variable of the original factor


## Definition:

For a factor $f_{1}\left(X_{1}, \ldots, X_{k}\right)$, summing out a variable $X_{i}$ yields a new factor

$$
f_{2}\left(X_{1}, \ldots, X_{i-1}, X_{i+1}, \ldots, X_{k}\right)=\left(\sum_{X_{i}} f_{1}\right)
$$

such that for all values $v_{1}, \ldots, v_{i-1}, v_{i+1}, \ldots, v_{k}$ in the domain of $X_{1}, \ldots X_{i-1}, X_{i+1}, \ldots, X_{k}$

$$
f_{2}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{i-1}, v_{i+1}, \ldots, v_{k}\right)=\sum_{\mathrm{v}_{\mathrm{i}} \in \operatorname{dom}\left(X_{i}\right)} f_{1}\left(v_{1}, \ldots, v_{i-1}, \mathbf{v}_{\mathbf{i}}, v_{i+1}, \ldots, v_{k}\right) .
$$

## Summing Out Example

$$
f_{2}(B)=\sum_{A} f_{1}(A, B)
$$

| $f_{1}$ |
| :--- |
| $\mathbf{A}$ $\mathbf{B}$ value <br>  F F <br>  $\mathbf{F}$ T <br>  0.1  <br> T F 0.3 T |



## Variable Elimination

- Given observations $Y_{1}=v_{1}, \ldots, Y_{k}=v_{k}$ and query variable $Q$, we want

$$
P\left(Q \mid Y_{1}=v_{1}, \ldots, Y_{k}=v_{k}\right)=\frac{P\left(Q, Y_{1}=v_{1}, \ldots, Y_{k}=v_{k}\right)}{\sum_{q \in \operatorname{dom}(Q)} P\left(Q=q, Y_{1}=v_{1}, \ldots, Y_{k}=v_{k}\right)} .
$$

- Basic idea of variable elimination:

1. Condition on observations by conditioning
2. Construct joint distribution factor by multiplication
3. Remove unwanted variables (neither query nor observed) by summing out
4. Normalize at the end

- Doing these steps in order is correct but not efficient
- Efficiency comes from interleaving the order of operations


## Sums of Products

2. Construct joint distribution factor by multiplication
3. Remove unwanted variables (neither query nor observed) by summing out

The computationally intensive part of variable elimination is computing sums of products

Example: multiply factors $f_{1}(Q, A, B, C), f_{2}(C, D, E)$; sum out $A, E$

1. $f_{3}(Q, A, B, C, D, E)=f_{1}(Q, A, B, C) \times f_{2}(C, D, E): 2^{6}$ multiplications
2. $f_{4}(Q, B, C, D)=\sum_{A, E} f_{3}(Q, A, B, C, D, E): 3 \times 16$ additions

Total: 112 computations

## Efficient Sums of Products

We can reduce the number of computations required by changing their order.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \sum_{A} \sum_{E} f_{1}(Q, A, B, C) \times f_{2}(C, D, E) \\
& =\left(\sum_{A} f_{1}(Q, A, B, C)\right) \times\left(\sum_{E} f_{2}(C, D, E)\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

1. $f_{3}(C, D)=\Sigma_{E} f_{2}(C, D, E): 2^{2}$ additions
2. $f_{4}(Q, B, C)=\Sigma_{A} f_{1}(Q, A, B, C): 2^{3}$ additions
3. $f_{5}(Q, B, C, D)=f_{3}(Q, B, C) \times f_{4}(B, C, D): 2^{4}$ multiplications

Total: 28 computations

## Variable Elimination Algorithm

Input: query variable $Q$; set of variables $V s$; observations $O$; factors $P s$ representing conditional probability tables

```
Fs:= Ps
for each }X\mathrm{ in Vs\{Q} according to some elimination ordering:
    Rs:={F\inFs|Finvolves X}
    if }X\inO\mathrm{ :
        for each F F\inRs:
            F
            Fs:=(Fs\{F})\cup{\mp@subsup{F}{}{\prime}}
    else:
        T:= product of factors in Rs
        N:= sum X out of T
        Fs:=(Fs\Rs)\cup{N}
T:= product of factors in Fs
N:= sum Q out of T
return T/N (i.e., normalize T)
```


## Variable Elimination Example: Conditioning

Query: P(Tampering | Smoke=true, Report=true)
Variable ordering: Smoke, Report, Fire, Alarm, Leaving
P (Tampering, Fire, Alarm, Smoke, Leaving, Report) =
P(Tampering)P(Fire)P(Alarm|Tampering,Fire)P(Smoke|Fire)P(Leaving|Alarm)P(Report|Leaving)
Construct factors for each table:
$\left\{f_{0}\right.$ (Tampering), $f_{1}$ (Fire), $f_{2}$ (Tampering,Alarm,Fire), $f_{3}$ (Smoke,Fire), $f_{4}$ (Leaving,Alarm), $f_{5}$ (Report,Leaving) $\}$
Condition on Smoke: $f_{6}=\left(f_{3}\right)$ smoke=true
$\left\{f_{0}\right.$ (Tampering), $f_{1}$ (Fire), $f_{2}$ (Tampering,Alarm,Fire), $f_{6}$ (Fire), $f_{4}$ (Leaving,Alarm), $f_{5}$ (Report,Leaving) $\}$
Condition on Report: $f_{7}=\left(f_{5}\right)_{\text {Report=true }}$
$\left\{f_{0}\right.$ (Tampering), $f_{1}$ (Fire), $f_{2}$ (Tampering,Alarm,Fire), $f_{6}$ (Fire), $f_{4}$ (Leaving,Alarm), $f_{7}$ (Leaving) $\}$

# Variable Elimination Example: Elimination 

Query: P(Tampering | Smoke=true, Report=true)
Variable ordering: Smoke, Report, Fire, Alarm, Leaving
$\left\{f_{0}\right.$ (Tampering), $f_{1}$ (Fire), $f_{2}$ (Tampering,Alarm,Fire), $f_{6}$ (Fire), $f_{4}$ (Leaving,Alarm), $f_{7}$ (Leaving) $\}$
Sum out Fire from product of $f_{1}, f_{2}, f_{6}: f_{8}=\sum_{\text {Fire }}\left(f_{1} \times f_{2} \times f_{6}\right)$
$\left\{f_{0}\right.$ (Tampering), $f_{8}$ (Tampering,Alarm), $f_{4}$ (Leaving,Alarm), $f_{7}$ (Leaving) $\}$
Sum out Alarm from product of $f_{8}, f_{4}: f_{9}=\sum_{\text {Alarm }}\left(f_{8} \times f_{4}\right)$
$\left\{f_{0}\right.$ (Tampering), $f_{9}$ (Tampering,Leaving), $f_{7}$ (Leaving) $\}$
Sum out Leaving from product of $f_{9}, f_{7}: f_{10}=\sum$ Leaving $\left(f_{9} \times f_{7}\right)$
$\left\{f_{0}\right.$ (Tampering), $f_{10}$ (Tampering) $\}$

## Variable Elimination Example: Normalization

Query: P(Tampering | Smoke=true, Report=true)<br>Variable ordering: Smoke, Report, Fire, Alarm, Leaving<br>$\left\{f_{0}\right.$ (Tampering), $f_{10}$ (Tampering) $\}$

Product of remaining factors: $f_{11}=f_{0} \times f_{10}$
$\left\{f_{11}\right.$ (Tampering) $\}$
Normalize by division:
query(Tampering) $=f_{11}$ (Tampering) $/\left(\sum_{\text {Tampering }} f_{11}\right.$ (Tampering $\left.)\right)$

## Optimizing Elimination Order

- Variable elimination exploits efficient sums of products on a factored joint distribution
- The elimination order of the variables affects the efficiency of the algorithm
- Finding an optimal elimination ordering is NP-hard
- Heuristics (rules of thumb) for good orderings:
- Observations first: Condition on all of the observed variables first
- Min-factor: At every stage, select the variable that constructs the smallest new factor
- Problem-specific heuristics


## Optimization: Pruning

- The structure of the graph can allow us to drop leaf nodes that are neither observed nor queried
- Summing them out for free
- We can repeat this process:



## Optimization: Preprocessing

Finally, if we know that we are always going to be observing and/or querying the same variables, we can preprocess our graph; e.g.:

1. Precompute the joint distribution of all the variables we will observe and/or query
2. Precompute conditional distributions for our exact queries

## Summary

- Variable elimination is an algorithm for answering queries based on a belief network
- Operates by using three operations on factors to reduce graph to a single posterior distribution

1. Conditioning
2. Multiplication
3. Summing out

- Distributes operations more efficiently than taking full product and then summing out
- Optimal order of operations is NP-hard to compute
- Additional optimization techniques: heuristic ordering, pruning, precomputation

